

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42

Chapter 1

Garcia de Orta in the Context of the  
Sephardic Diaspora

Jon Arrizabalaga

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42

It is nowadays generally accepted that the physician and natural historian Garcia de Orta (Castelo de Vide, circa 1500–Goa, 1568), one of the most universal figures in the Portuguese medical and scientific historiography because of the relevance of his *Colóquios dos simples e drogas e cousas medicinãis da India* (Goa, 1563), was a remarkable exponent of the Sephardic diaspora, and that his biographic vicissitudes had much in common with those of the Jewish medical elites in the early modern Iberian world. For most of the time, however, this circumstance has been ignored. Indeed, despite having been disclosed by Augusto da Silva Carvalho in 1934, in the 1960s it was still being denied by most Portuguese historians, and only during subsequent decades gradually began to be accepted.

This article focuses on Garcia de Orta in the context of the Sephardic diaspora. After an overview of the implications that his *christão-novo* condition had for his life and career, and the changing fortunes of his family as a result of inquisitorial repression, I will analyse how Orta's crypto-Jewish identity was gradually disclosed. Particular attention will be paid to the resistance of the Portuguese *establishment* historians, led by a nationalistic and orthodox-Catholic agenda, to accepting that such an outstanding figure in the history of medicine, science and Portuguese language could be stained by this *stigma*.

**The Historical Framework of the Sephardic Diaspora**

Between the mid-fifteenth and the late seventeenth century, a period of more than 200 years, Iberian Jews suffered many great difficulties which would to a great extent determine their subsequent history. In 1478 the Catholic Monarchs set up a new Inquisition in Spain with the main purpose of prosecuting crypto-Judaism or Marranism. Fifteen years later (1492), a decree of forced conversion to Christianity caused a large number of Spanish Jews to emigrate to Portugal during the 1490s and the following decades. In the case of Portugal, however, almost 40 years elapsed between Don Manuel's enactment of the edict which

1 implied that those Jews not prepared to be converted would be expelled (1497), 1  
 2 and the first formal setting up of the Portuguese Inquisition in 1531; the period 2  
 3 in between having been qualified as that of an ‘attempted peaceful assimilation’. 3  
 4 And it was not until 1548 that the Portuguese Holy Office obtained complete 4  
 5 freedom of action, the previous 17 years having seen a continuous battle between 5  
 6 the papacy and King João III for its control.<sup>1</sup> 6

7 These circumstances help to explain not only the strong cohesion of 7  
 8 Portuguese Jewish communities in the following centuries, in contrast to the 8  
 9 greater uprooting of the Spanish ones,<sup>2</sup> but also the different pace in the gradual 9  
 10 implementation (in the kingdoms under the Spanish Monarchy from the mid- 10  
 11 fifteenth century onwards, and in Portugal from the period of the Iberian Union 11  
 12 (1581–1640) of ‘purity of blood’ laws that legalized the social exclusion of 12  
 13 *christãos novos*, blocking their access to any public position or high honour, or at 13  
 14 least making it more difficult. 14

15 As result of these events, two mass dispersions of Iberian Jews or Sephardic 15  
 16 diasporas happened, one immediately resulting from the late fifteenth-century 16  
 17 expulsion decrees, mostly towards the Eastern Mediterranean and Northern 17  
 18 African regions, and another, throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth 18  
 19 centuries, towards different destinations in Western Europe, such as Italy (Venice, 19  
 20 Verona, Livorno), the Low Countries (Antwerp, Amsterdam), southern France 20  
 21 (Bordeaux, Bayonne), London, Hamburg, as well as towards the West Indies 21  
 22 (the Caribbean area, Brazil) and the East Indies (Goa). 22

23 The changing political relationships between the two Iberian Crowns 23  
 24 throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries are essential in 24  
 25 understanding the migratory flows of the Jewish population back and forth 25  
 26 between the territories under both monarchies. These occurred because of the 26  
 27 need to avoid inquisitorial repression just as much as because of the emigrants’ 27  
 28 fluctuating expectations for their own socio-economic improvement in one or 28  
 29 other of the two kingdoms.<sup>3</sup> Finally, the overseas territories resulting from the 29  
 30

31 <sup>1</sup> On the Portuguese Jews and the Inquisition see, for instance, I.-S. Révah, ‘Les 31  
 32 marranes portugais et l’Inquisition au XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle’ [1959–60], in Charles Amiel (ed.), *Études* 32  
 33 *portugaises* (Lisbon–Paris, 1975), pp. 185–229; E. Cunha de Azevedo Mea, ‘Inquisizione 33  
 34 Portuguese’ and ‘Nouvi Cristiani, Portogallo’, in Adriano Prosperi with Vincenzo Lavenia 34  
 35 and John Tedeschi (eds), *Dizionario storico dell’Inquisizione* (Roma, 2010), vol. II, pp. 35  
 36 811–15, 1124–7. 36

37 <sup>2</sup> Yosef Hayim Yerushalmi, *De la corte española al gueto italiano: marranismo y judaísmo* 37  
 38 *en la España del siglo XVII: el caso de Isaac Cardoso* (Madrid, 1989), pp. 23–4. 38

39 <sup>3</sup> So, for instance, the rigours of the Portuguese Inquisition after Portugal’s annexation 39  
 40 to the Hispanic Crown by Philip II (1556–98) meant that many descendants of Jews expelled 40  
 41 by the Catholic monarchs who had taken refuge in Portugal and been obliged to convert to 41  
 42 Christianity in 1497 escaped back to Spain where the *converso* question at that time provoked 42  
 42 less virulence. Furthermore, Philip IV (1621–65) offered for a while very attractive socio-

1 imperial expansion of both Crowns increasingly provided suitable places for 1  
 2 the Sephardic Jews to begin a new life. Taking advantage of the demographic 2  
 3 demands of the Spanish and Portuguese empires, and of the support given to 3  
 4 them by a growing network of relatives and friends settled there, they could find 4  
 5 new opportunities to develop their professional careers and/or do business. 5

6

7

### 8 **The Christão Novo Garcia De Orta, his Family and the Portuguese Holy** 8 9 **Office in Goa** 9

10

11 The biography of Garcia de Orta (circa 1500–68) clearly illustrates some of the 11  
 12 vicissitudes of the Sephardic diaspora. The major events of his life and career are 12  
 13 now quite well established.<sup>4</sup> He was born in Castelo de Vide (Alentejo), close 13  
 14 to the Spanish border in about 1500. His parents were Spanish Jews who may 14  
 15 have moved to Portugal on the occasion of the Catholic Monarchs' decree of 15  
 16 expulsion of the Jews (1492). His father, Fernão de Orta (died in 1521), was a 16  
 17 merchant, a native of Valencia de Alcántara (Extremadura) who moved to the 17  
 18 neighbouring Portuguese town of Castelo de Vide, and appears to have been 18  
 19 forced to become a *christão novo* in 1497. Earlier he had had a son (Jorge de 19  
 20 Orta) by a Castilian woman called Brites Nunes. This son settled on his own 20  
 21 at Elvas before 1504 along with his mother. At about the same time, Fernão 21  
 22 de Orta married Leonor Gomes, a native of Albuquerque (Extremadura), and 22  
 23 they had four children, namely, Garcia de Orta and his sisters Violante, Catarina 23  
 24 and Isabel.<sup>5</sup> 24

25 Garcia de Orta studied medicine in the Spanish universities of Salamanca 25  
 26 and Alcalá (circa 1515–20), where he appears to have obtained the title of 26

27

28 economic opportunities to the Portuguese 'new Christians' who migrated to Spain, although 28  
 29 the living conditions of these immigrants rapidly deteriorated after the revolt that enabled 29  
 30 the kingdom of Portugal to recover its independence from Spanish dominion in 1640. See 30  
 31 Richard L Kagan, *Students and Society in Early Modern Spain* (Baltimore–London, 1974), 31  
 32 pp. 90–92; Henry Kamen, *Inquisition and Society in Spain in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth* 32  
 33 *Centuries* (London, 1985), pp. 221–31. 33

34 <sup>4</sup> On Garcia de Orta, see the classical works by Conde de Ficalho, *Garcia da Orta e o* 34  
 35 *seu tempo* (Lisboa, 1886); Augusto da Silva Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', *Revista da Universidade* 35  
 36 *de Coimbra*, 13 (1934): 61–246; I.–S. Révah, 'La famille de Garcia de Orta', *Revista da* 36  
 37 *Universidade de Coimbra*, 19 (1960): 407–20; Harry Friedenwald, *The Jews and Medicine.* 37  
 38 *Essays* (2 vols, Baltimore, 1944), vol. II, pp. 430–47; as well as the most recent biographical 38  
 39 sketches by F. Moreno de Carvalho, 'Orta, Garcia da', in W.F. and H. Bynum (eds), *Dictionary* 39  
 40 *of Medical Biography* (5 vols, Westport, 2007), vol. IV, pp. 946–7; A.M.L. Andrade, 'Orta, 40  
 41 *Garcia de', in Adriano Prosperi with Vincenzo Lavenia and John Tedeschi (eds), Dizionario* 41  
 42 *storico dell'Inquisizione* (4 vols, Rome, 2010), vol. II, p. 1147. 41

42 <sup>5</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 69–72. 42

1 *licenciado*.<sup>6</sup> His early medical career was developed in Portugal, first at Castelo 1  
 2 de Vide, and from 1526 at Lisbon. After three frustrated attempts to obtain 2  
 3 posts in the arts faculty at Lisbon University, in 1530 he gained a provisional 3  
 4 lectureship in natural philosophy. Moreover, in October 1533 he was elected as 4  
 5 a representative to the University Council.<sup>7</sup> 5

6 In March 1534, he sailed for India as chief physician aboard the fleet of 6  
 7 Martim Affonso de Sousa, the *capitã-mor do mar* of the East Portuguese 7  
 8 Indies (1534–38) as well as Orta's master and protector, and arrived at Goa 8  
 9 in September 1534. From 1534 to 1538 he travelled with Sousa on various 9  
 10 campaigns on the western coast of India from Gujarat to Ceylon, including 10  
 11 the cities of Diu, Chaul, Bassein and Cochin, among others. Then, from 1538 11  
 12 to his death in 1568, he settled at Goa, where he soon became a prominent 12  
 13 medical practitioner with a distinguished clientele including the local sultan and 13  
 14 several Portuguese viceroys and governors of Goa, in addition to being a well- 14  
 15 off merchant in the spice trade. About 1540–42 he married a cousin Brianda 15  
 16 de Solis, whose father, Henrique de Solis, was a *christão novo* and a powerful 16  
 17 merchant who had moved to India in the spring of 1541. In 1563 he published 17  
 18 at Goa the *Colóquios dos simples e drogas e cousas medicinãis da Índia*. Although 18  
 19 during his life Garcia de Orta was not disturbed by the Holy Office, he was 19  
 20 posthumously convicted of Judaism, and his remains were exhumed, subjected 20  
 21 to an *auto-da-fé*, and burned in 1580 at Goa. Relatives, among them two sisters, 21  
 22 were prosecuted by the Inquisition from the 1540s, first in Portugal and then 22  
 23 also in Goa, and many of his descendants continued to be for generations 23  
 24 thereafter. So it was that members of different branches of Orta's family spread 24  
 25 through different Portuguese Jewish communities around the world. 25

26 Many of the features of Garcia de Orta's biography reveal a profile similar to 26  
 27 those of other remarkable Jewish physicians in early modern Iberia. They were 27  
 28 frequently members of rather well-off families with a high degree of mobility 28  
 29 between the territories of the two Iberian Crowns. They studied medicine in 29  
 30 Spanish and/or Portuguese universities, although in most cases they do not 30  
 31 appear to have managed to achieve the highest academic degree. Their early 31  
 32 attempts to opt for academic careers frequently ended in failure. So, they 32  
 33 tended to find social promotion through the alternative of serving a noble 33  
 34 \_\_\_\_\_ 34

35 <sup>6</sup> Ficalho, *Garcia da Orta e o seu tempo*, pp. 35–7. To the best of my knowledge, it 35  
 36 is by no means clear when and where Garcia de Orta received the title of *doutor* that was 36  
 37 repeatedly associated with his name in the *Colóquios*. 37

38 <sup>7</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 77–8. Silva Carvalho echoes Teixeira de Carvalho's 38  
 39 hypothesis that after this lectureship Orta might also have occupied another provisional post 39  
 40 in moral philosophy during the period 1531–32. There is no documentary evidence at all 40  
 41 that Orta was ever appointed, as Ficalho and Carvalho suggested, as a royal doctor to João III 41  
 42 (1521–57) at the request of Martim Affonso da Sousa (Ficalho, *Garcia da Orta e o seu tempo*, 42  
 pp. 45–6; Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', p. 79).

1 patron either civil or ecclesiastical, and to search for supplementary security 1  
 2 through their professional prestige and having a distinguished clientele. They 2  
 3 would take advantage of being part of a dense social network, woven through 3  
 4 close family and community solidarity links and economic interests, to develop 4  
 5 their lives and careers and even to do profitable business. In this regard, the 5  
 6 Sephardic diaspora provided medical practitioners of the Jewish minority with 6  
 7 a particularly efficient network to take in the *émigrés*, on the basis of their family 7  
 8 connexions and community support, beyond their religious convictions.<sup>8</sup> 8

9 While high mobility and a travelling profile was a remarkably common feature 9  
 10 in the sociology of early modern Iberian practitioners of the Jewish minority, 10  
 11 their destinations were highly influential in the fortune of their further careers 11  
 12 in the diaspora and religious tolerance, which, dictated by varying circumstances 12  
 13 and highly fluctuating over time, was a major variable conditioning their lives 13  
 14 and fates. The case of Amatus Lusitanus (1511–68), another Portuguese Jewish 14  
 15 practitioner whose coeval life had many parallels with Garcia de Orta's, is 15  
 16 paradigmatic at this point. After having studied medicine at Salamanca where 16  
 17 he took his degree about 1530, Amatus's career developed in Lisbon until 17  
 18 1533, when the growing hostility towards the Marranos led him to abandon 18  
 19 Portugal. He subsequently lived in Antwerp (1533–41), Ferrara (1541–47), 19  
 20 Ancona (1547–50, 1551–55), Rome (1550–51), Pesaro (1555–56), Ragusa/ 20  
 21 Dubrovnik (1556–58) and Salonika (1558–68) where he died a victim of 21  
 22 plague. All these cities had significant Jewish communities, even though they 22  
 23 were not always protective enough of Amatus in the face of the Holy Office's 23  
 24 persecution. And, no wonder, it was only in Salonika, a former Byzantine city 24  
 25 taken by the Ottomans in 1430, which from 1492 onwards had become the 25  
 26 most relevant city of the Sephardic diaspora, thanks to the climate of religious 26  
 27 tolerance that the Turkish sultans gave to Jews, that Amatus could enjoy a 27  
 28 continuously peaceful life.<sup>9</sup> In contrast, Garcia de Orta appears to have led a 28

29  
 30  
 31 <sup>8</sup> See Jon Arrizabalaga, 'The World of Iberian converso practitioners, from Lluís 31  
 32 Alcanyís to Isaac Cardoso', in Victor Navarro and William Eamon (eds), *Más allá de la* 32  
 33 *Leyenda Negra: España y la Revolución Científica/Beyond the Black Legend: Spain and the* 33  
 34 *Scientific Revolution* (Valencia, 2007), pp. 307–22 (pp. 313–18). 34

35 <sup>9</sup> On Amatus Lusitanus see, for example Maximiano Lemos, *Amato Lusitano. A sua* 35  
 36 *vida e a sua obra* (Porto, 1907); Friedenwald, *The Jews and Medicine*, vol. I, pp. 332–80; 36  
 37 Francisco Moreno de Carvalho, 'Amatus Lusitanus, João Rodrigues de Castelo Branco', in 37  
 38 W.F. Bynum and Helen Bynum (eds), *Dictionary of Medical Biography*, vol. I, pp. 111–12; 38  
 39 António Manuel Lopes Andrade, 'De Antuérpia a Ferrara: o caminho de Amato Lusitano e da 39  
 40 sua família', *Cadernos da Cultura. Medicina na Beira interior da Pre-história ao século XXI*, 25  
 41 (2011): 7–14; António Lopes Andrade and Hugo Miguel Crespo, 'Os inventários dos bens 40  
 42 de Amato Lusitano, Francisco Barbosa e Joseph Molcho, em Ancona, na fuga à Inquisição 41  
 42 (1555)', *Ágora. Estudos Clássicos em debate*, 14(1) (2012): 45–90. 42

1 dual religious life in Goa for 30 years, without any major personal disruption 1  
 2 from the Inquisition. 2

3 Certainly, Garcia de Orta's family had been in trouble with the Portuguese 3  
 4 Holy Office at least from 1547, when his sisters Catarina and Isabel were accused 4  
 5 of Judaism and imprisoned in Lisbon for a year. Yet, this first clash with the Holy 5  
 6 Office managed to be favourably resolved at all events, thanks to the influential 6  
 7 contacts of Garcia de Orta at the Portuguese court. Without dismissing an 7  
 8 eventual intervention by his master Martim Affonso da Sousa, Carvalho tended 8  
 9 to suppose that the helping hand which for a time played a key role in protecting 9  
 10 the Orta family in Portugal was that of his powerful relative Thomaz de Orta, 10  
 11 a royal physician to João III, whose brother Luiz de Orta, by the way, was a 11  
 12 surgeon at the Ormuz hospital.<sup>10</sup> 12

13 The fate of the Orta family, however, became increasingly complicated as a 13  
 14 result of various accusations of crypto-Judaism from 1550 on against its members 14  
 15 and/or their consorts before various inquisitorial courts in Portugal. The 15  
 16 interventions by the courts of Évora and Lisbon involved a number of relatives 16  
 17 living in Portugal, namely, in 1559, Beatriz de Orta, a daughter of Jorge de Orta, 17  
 18 step-brother of Garcia, and her husband Gabriel Luiz, a surgeon at Elvas; and 18  
 19 in 1561, Beatriz's brother Francisco de Orta, a medical practitioner who had 19  
 20 received his bachelor's degree at Salamanca. The first difficulties entailed arrests, 20  
 21 prosecutions, imprisonments and torture. Certainly, their victims could make a 21  
 22 new life afterwards, but, in any case, they were the origin of the accusations that 22  
 23 unleashed a harsh inquisitorial repression of Garcia de Orta's family in Goa from 23  
 24 1568 onwards.<sup>11</sup> Moreover, other *chistãos novos* related to the Orta family were 24  
 25 subjected to inquisitorial procedures in the Portuguese East Indies. This was the 25  
 26 case of Bastião Mendes, married to Filipa Gomes, a daughter of Garcia's sister 26  
 27 Catarina, who was first accused in 1557 of having had close relations with Jews 27  
 28 and practised the Jewish religion during a former winter stay at Malacca in 1553, 28  
 29 and who was eventually prosecuted in 1569 on the occasion of his retirement to 29  
 30 Lisbon where he died in prison in 1571.<sup>12</sup> 30

31 Although closely related to the deployment of the Portuguese Inquisition, 31  
 32 these adverse circumstances were not alien to the climate of religious and moral 32  
 33 rearmament that the whole Catholic Church was experiencing as a result of the 33  
 34 Council of Trent (1545–63), a historical turning point marking the guidelines 34  
 35 of the Catholic Counter-Reformation in which the Jesuits played a crucial 35  
 36 role. And not even the distant capital of the Portuguese East Indies could 36  
 37 escape from an increasingly strained atmosphere from the mid-1540s to 1560, 37  
 38 38

39 39

40 40

41 41

42 42

<sup>10</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 97–8.

<sup>11</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 97, 127, 201–2.

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 127, 226–9.

1 when the Inquisition Court of Goa was formally established.<sup>13</sup> Headed by the 1  
 2 Company's co-founder, Francisco Xavier, the first three Jesuits had arrived there 2  
 3 in 1542. During the biennium 1545–46 Xavier wrote a number of letters to 3  
 4 both the provincial superior and the king of Portugal. He complained to the 4  
 5 former about the 'heresy and impiety scandalising Goa' and asked permission 5  
 6 to resort to extraordinary means to fight them. Furthermore, he made a request 6  
 7 to João III, who had just forbidden Hinduism, to establish the Inquisition in 7  
 8 India, arguing that there were 'many living under the Mosaic law and in Moorish 8  
 9 sects, with no fear of God and shame from the world'.<sup>14</sup> Yet, despite Xavier's 9  
 10 requests and the fact that the Jesuits understood their mission in the Orient as a 10  
 11 'just war' against every sort of demon (Jews, Muslims, gentiles, heretics, avarice, 11  
 12 bad customs, injustice, loose conscience and so on), until 1557 they were rather 12  
 13 more in favour of fighting these demons with the weapons of Christ's peace, 13  
 14 namely, God's word, good acts, prayer and sacraments, and by questioning the 14  
 15 appropriacy and efficacy of inquisitorial repression for the Catholic Church's 15  
 16 evangelising tasks in India.<sup>15</sup> 16

17 Notwithstanding, religious pressure against Jews did not cease in Goa and 17  
 18 other cities of Portuguese India from the 1540s. After two early lynch law 18  
 19 executions in Goa, of a *christão novo* (1539) and of a young physician called 19  
 20 Jerónimo Dias (1543), both having been charged of Judaizing, the earliest major 20  
 21 inquisitorial trial against Portuguese New Christians in India appears to have 21  
 22 involved a 70-year-old woman (Leonor Caldeira) and 19 other compatriots, 22  
 23 10 from Cochin and 10 from Goa, who were mostly related to each other 23  
 24 through family connections who had devoted themselves to handcrafts and 24  
 25 trading activities. As a result of an official inquiry (*devassa*) held in 1557–59, 25  
 26 they were shipped to Portugal in 1560, prosecuted and sentenced by the Lisbon 26  
 27 Holy Office and subjected to the corresponding *autos-da-fé* (1561) in which 27  
 28 Leonor was executed. From the inquisitorial trials it is clear that they belonged 28  
 29 to a society where *christãos-novos*, having emigrated from Portugal as a result of 29  
 30 inquisitorial pressure, and Sephardic Jews settled in the Ottoman empire, kept 30

31

32

33

34

35 <sup>13</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 104–6. On the establishment and early years of the 35  
 36 Inquisition in Goa, see, among others, António Baião, *A Inquisição de Goa* (2 vols, Lisbon, 36  
 37 1949; Coimbra, 1930); Ana Cannas da Cunha, *A Inquisição no Estado da Índia. Origens* 37  
 38 *(1539–1560)* (Lisboa, 1995); C. Amiel, 'Goa', in Adriano Prosperi with Vincenzo Lavenia 38  
 39 and John Tedeschi (eds), *Dizionario storico dell'Inquisizione*, vol. II, pp. 716–8. 39

40 <sup>14</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', p. 104: '... porque ha muitos que vivem a ley mosaica e seita 40  
 41 mourisca, sem nenhun temor de Deos e vergonha do mundo'. Cannas da Cunha, *A Inquisição* 41  
 42 *no Estado da Índia*, p. 348. 41

42 <sup>15</sup> Cannas da Cunha, *A Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, pp. 115–22, 125–31. 42

1 close links with each other as well as with renowned New Christians in Lisbon, 1  
2 while developing a notable economic activity outside Portugal.<sup>16</sup> 2

3 By the time this case happened, the Jesuits' position had radically shifted in 3  
4 favour of those supporting repressive measures (those who eventually won the 4  
5 day) and they had moved on to play an important role in the debates around 5  
6 the implementation of the Court of Inquisition in Goa. Finally, in March 1560 6  
7 the *Tribunal do Santo Ofício* was formally set up, despite discrepancies among 7  
8 different clergymen and religious orders (for instance the Dominicans and 8  
9 Franciscans appear to have shared a more religious and less political viewpoint 9  
10 than the Jesuits) and a power conflict between religious and civil authorities. 10  
11 Furthermore the Jews had attempted to persuade them in different ways, 11  
12 including a collection of 570,000 Indian reals that the New Christians of 12  
13 Portugal sent via Medina del Campo and Antwerp to Pope Paul IV (1555–59) 13  
14 in 1557. However one month later the two first inquisitors, namely, Aleixo Dias 14  
15 Falcão and Francisco Marques Botelho, were sent to India. Their agenda was 15  
16 determined by a founding document prioritizing the repressive activities against 16  
17 the *cristãos-novos* in contrast to a less rigorous procedure set out for converting 17  
18 Brahmanists and Muslims, who would be temporarily excluded from the hard- 18  
19 line inquisitorial action.<sup>17</sup> 19

20 Although Garcia de Orta did not die until early 1568, the Inquisition never 20  
21 took action against him during his lifetime for reasons unknown. Carvalho 21  
22 suggested that it may simply have been compassion towards a very old and 22  
23 seriously ill man, or recognition of his great prestige.<sup>18</sup> However, soon after his 23  
24 death, in late October that year, his sister Catarina de Orta was arrested at the 24  
25 request of the Goa Inquisitor Aleixo Dias Falcão. Her prosecution led her to 25  
26 be burned at the stake in October 1569, after a long year of interrogations and 26  
27 torture as a result of which no less than 12 relatives were accused and sentenced to 27  
28 different punishments (from one more death penalty to abjuration), in addition 28  
29 to the prosecution of a great number of newly accused during the subsequent 29  
30

31

32 <sup>16</sup> Ibid., pp. 126–49, 167–226; António José Saraiva, *The Marrano Factory. The* 32  
33 *Portuguese Inquisition and its New Christians, 1536–1765* (Leiden, 2001), pp. 348–50. 33

34 <sup>17</sup> Cannas da Cunha, *A Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, pp. 134–49; Saraiva, *The Marrano* 34  
35 *Factory*, p. 350. 35

36 <sup>18</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 98–9. In a remarkable article recently published by 36  
37 Ines G. Županov, it has been suggested that there was a noticeable contrast between the 37  
38 health schemes proposed to the Portuguese colonial authorities at Goa by the new Christian 38  
39 physician Garcia de Orta, and by the Jesuits. Whether they had, in fact, eventually clashed 39  
40 with each other or not, to me, is not at all clear. In a later work, Županov has proposed that 40  
41 the *Colóquios* helped to save Orta. See Ines G. Županov, 'Botanizing in Portuguese India: 41  
42 *Orta and Alexander von Humboldt; Across the East and the West* (Lisbon, 2009), pp. 21–31. 42

1 decades at least until the 1640s.<sup>19</sup> Not even Garcia de Orta himself escaped this 1  
 2 inquisitorial zeal, and his posthumous prosecution led to the celebration of an 2  
 3 *auto da fé* presided over by the Inquisitor Bartolomeu da Fonseca at Goa cathedral 3  
 4 on 4 December 1580, where his remains were exhumed, given to the secular 4  
 5 justice and burned as guilty of the charge of being Jewish (*por judeu*).<sup>20</sup> During 5  
 6 the subsequent years, the Inquisition of Goa ordered searches of bookshops 6  
 7 for books by infidel authors and many volumes were burned, most probably 7  
 8 including, Carvalho claimed, every copy of Garcia de Orta's *Colóquios* that they 8  
 9 were able to find, since no copy of this work has been preserved in India.<sup>21</sup> 9

10 The feeling of horror unleashed in the heart of the Orta family as a result of 10  
 11 the prosecution and execution of Catarina and the trials of the remaining accused 11  
 12 must have caused the flight from Goa of many relatives living there, in search of 12  
 13 other safer places. It has not been easy to follow the trail of those descending 13  
 14 from Garcia or Catarina de Orta, and still less of the descendants of two more 14  
 15 sisters who had lived in Goa. Carvalho suggested that Garcia de Orta's widow 15  
 16 and daughters emigrated to some Jewish community in the Netherlands, France 16  
 17 or England, where presumably they openly professed Judaism – a hypothesis that 17  
 18 Révah declared himself unable to verify.<sup>22</sup> 18

19 In these circumstances, the prosecutions by the Inquisition of Lisbon of the 19  
 20 brothers Diogo and Francisco II de Orta, two grandsons of Catarina de Orta, are 20  
 21 helpful in providing information about the dimensions and other details of the 21  
 22 Portuguese Jewish diaspora. Their parents were still inhabitants of the Alentejan 22  
 23 town of Castelo de Vide where the Orta family had come from, although both 23  
 24 of them had been born in Lisbon.<sup>23</sup> 24

25 Francisco de Orta II (or David, his Jewish name) (born 1587) was interrogated 25  
 26 by the Lisbon Inquisition in 1642–43, when he was between 55 and 60 years old. 26  
 27 He declared that he had 10 brothers and sisters, among them Diogo de Orta, who 27  
 28 had lived in Amsterdam, married Maria Viegas ('reconciled' by the Holy Office) 28  
 29 and had five children, several of them with names both Christian and Jewish, 29  
 30 born in Italy, Amsterdam and Constantinople; Luiz de Orta, who appears to 30  
 31 31

32 <sup>19</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 202–15. Révah, 'La famille de Garcia de Orta', 32  
 33 pp. 416–20. 33

34 <sup>20</sup> 'Garcia d'Orta doutor christão novo português defunto morador que foi nesta cidade 34  
 35 [Goa] por judeu entregue seus ossos a justiça secular. Relaxado' (*Repertorio Geral*, BNL, cod. 35  
 36 203, c. 306v). Cf. Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', p. 133; Andrade, 'Orta, Garcia de', vol. II, p. 36  
 37 1147). 37

38 <sup>21</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 132–4. 38

39 <sup>22</sup> Ibid., p. 136; Révah, 'La famille de Garcia de Orta', 408. 39

40 <sup>23</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 223–5, 229; Révah, 'La famille de Garcia de Orta', pp. 40  
 41 410–11, 413–16; Anita Novinsky, 'A família marrana de Garcia de Orta, o "correio" dos 41  
 42 judeus', in Henry Méchoulan and Gérard Nahon (eds), *Mémorial I.-S. Révah: études sur le 42  
 marranisme, l'hétérodoxie juive et Spinoza* (Paris, 2001), pp. 357–69.

1 have been married in India; and Catarina and Filipa, both unmarried and already 1  
 2 dead in Lisbon. Francisco added that he had married Maria Nunes (also *reconciled* 2  
 3 by the Holy Office) and had five children, Jacob (born in Italy), Samuel (born 3  
 4 in Amsterdam), Guiomar/Ester, Jerónima/Raquel and Caná, in addition to five 4  
 5 others, previously deceased. He confessed that he had come into contact with a great 5  
 6 number of Portuguese Marranos, among them several physicians and pharmacists, 6  
 7 including the physician and polemicist Elijah Montalto (1567–1616), in the 7  
 8 Venetian ghetto, Amsterdam, Hamburg, Flanders, India and Lisbon, where he 8  
 9 appears to have often travelled before he was arrested.<sup>24</sup> 9  
 10 Francisco's brother, Diogo de Orta (born 1572), was arrested at Lisbon in 10  
 11 March 1596 under the accusation of crypto-Judaism, and spent almost eight years 11  
 12 in prison, until December 1603. Novinsky's thorough study of his inquisitorial 12  
 13 trial has showed that this business man played a crucial role in the propagation 13  
 14 of Judaism among the Marranos by acting as a secret agent [*correio*] in the service 14  
 15 of a clandestine communication network [*rede de comunicação*] intended to 15  
 16 keep the crypto-Jews in Portugal in contact with Jewish communities abroad, 16  
 17 namely in Italy (mostly the Venetian ghetto and Rome), Spain, Northern Africa, 17  
 18 the Ottoman empire and overseas possessions of the Portuguese empire (India, 18  
 19 Angola, and Brazil); all places he often travelled to in order to exchange news 19  
 20 and plans, and obtain financial support for Jews in Portugal.<sup>25</sup> 20

21

22

### 23 **The Sephardic Question in the Historiography of Garcia de Orta** 23

24

25 Garcia de Orta entered modern historiography thanks to the biography and 25  
 26 annotated edition of his *Colóquios* published by the aristocrat Francisco Manuel 26  
 27 de Melo Breyner, the fourth Count of Ficalho (1837–1903), between 1886 27  
 28 and 1895 at request of the *Academia Real das Sciencias de Lisboa*.<sup>26</sup> Surprisingly, 28  
 29 Ficalho's otherwise consistent biography of Garcia de Orta provides no mention 29  
 30 at all of his Jewish lineage, in contrast to the profusion of details concerning the 30

31

32 <sup>24</sup> On Francisco de Orta, see Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 223–5; Révah, 'La famille 32  
 33 de Garcia de Orta', pp. 413–16. 33

34 <sup>25</sup> On Diogo de Orta, see Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', p. 229; Révah, 'La famille de Garcia 34  
 35 de Orta', pp. 410–11; Novinsky, 'A familia marrana de Garcia de Orta, o 'correio' dos judeus', 35  
 36 pp. 361–9. 36

37 <sup>26</sup> Conde de Ficalho, *Garcia da Orta e o seu tempo* (Lisboa, 1886); *Coloquios dos* 37  
 38 *simples e drogas da India*. Edição publicada por deliberação da Academia Real das Sciencias 38  
 39 de Lisboa, dirigida e anotada pel ..., ed. Conde de Ficalho (2 vols, Lisboa, 1891–95). On 39  
 40 Ficalho's life and works, see Eduardo Burnay, *Elogio Historico do Conde de Ficalho, lido na* 40  
 41 *sessão solemne da Academia Real das Sciencias de Lisboa em 25 março de 1906* (Lisboa, 1906). 41  
 42 Ficalho was Professor of Botany at the Escola Politécnica and founded in 1878 the Jardim 42  
 Botânico of Lisbon.

1 life and career of this remarkable medical figure in sixteenth-century Portugal. 1  
 2 Indeed, the few details Ficalho provided about Orta's family origins, right at 2  
 3 the beginning of the work, were closely dependent upon what Diogo Barbosa 3  
 4 Machado had said in his monumental *Bibliotheca Lusitana* 150 years before, 4  
 5 namely that he was a native of Elvas and that his family had a client relationship 5  
 6 [*algumas relações de dependência*] with that of the noble Martim Affonso de 6  
 7 Sousa.<sup>27</sup> Then, Ficalho quickly moved on to focus on Orta's medical studies at 7  
 8 Salamanca and Alcalá, stressing, not without surprise, that his parents, despite 8  
 9 their presumably humble and obscure condition, managed to get 'protection 9  
 10 powerful enough or sufficient means of fortune to pay for him a highest scientific 10  
 11 education, the most complete one that could be got then in Spain, by dedicating 11  
 12 him to the liberal and valuable profession.'<sup>28</sup> 12

13 Furthermore, Ficalho's single relevant reference to Jews, made near the 13  
 14 middle of his long monograph, looks very expressive of an anti-Semitism that 14  
 15 was quite traditional in Catholicism at the time. It occurred at the end of an 15  
 16 overwhelmingly lusocentric review of the various ethno-religious communities 16  
 17 that formed part of Goa when Garcia de Orta arrived there. The fact that 17  
 18 only about 10 per cent (less than four pages) of this review was devoted to 18  
 19 describing its non-Portuguese population did not prevent Ficalho from taking 19  
 20 the opportunity to mention the Jews as one of the colonies of foreign merchants 20  
 21 at Goa, and to refer to them as that race eternally nomadic and harassed and 21  
 22 eternally active and powerful [*essa raça eternamente nomada e perseguida,* 22  
 23 *eternamente activa e ponderosa*].<sup>29</sup> He also recounted an offensive anecdote 23  
 24 24

25 <sup>27</sup> Diogo Barbosa Machado, *Bibliotheca Lusitana, Historia, Critica e Chronologica ...* (4 25  
 26 vols, Lisboa, 1741–58), vol. II, pp. 325–7; Ficalho, *Garcia da Orta e o seu tempo*, pp. 1–3. 26

27 <sup>28</sup> 'O certo, é que os paes de Garcia da Orta, se bem devessem ocupar uma posição 27  
 28 modesta e relativamente obscura, tinham já ou protecções bastante poderosas ou meios de 28  
 29 fortuna suficientes para lhe dar uma instrução superior, a mais completa que então se podia 29  
 30 obter na Hespanha, destinando-o assim a uma profissão liberal e considerada' (Ficalho, 30  
 31 *Garcia da Orta e o seu tempo*, p. 3).

32 <sup>29</sup> Actually, Ficalho devoted 90 per cent (pp. 144–69) of his review to describing the 31  
 32 minority Portuguese, namely the viceroy or Portuguese governor and his court, noblemen, 32  
 33 soldiers, tax collectors and justice servants, clergymen led by the bishop and mainly 33  
 34 consisting of Franciscans, Dominicans and Jesuits and the class of the so-called '*cidadãos,* 34  
 35 *moradores* ou *casados*'. And he had quite sufficient with a mere 10 per cent (pp. 169–73) to 35  
 36 deal with the vast and varied remaining population, namely the Indian people (*canarins*), 36  
 37 most of whom worked in the most humble trades (farming, transport, laundry) while a 37  
 38 well-off minority devoted themselves to trade between East and West with clothes, china 38  
 39 and precious stones, and to the business of loaning big capital; a numerous colony of diverse 39  
 40 foreign merchants either well settled or occasional, including some Europeans (Venetians, 40  
 41 Flemish and Germans) and, above all, Cambodians, Jews, Armenian Christians, Tamils, and 41  
 42 'many Persians, Arabs, Abyssinians, and other Oriental people' (Ficalho, *Garcia da Orta e o* 41  
 42 *seu tempo*, pp. 139–73). 42

1 *à propos* of the encounter near Suez between the Portuguese troops led by 1  
 2 Estevão da Gama (circa 1505–76), the son of Vasco da Gama and governor of 2  
 3 the Gold Coast and East Indies, and the local Jewish community: 3

4 4  
 5 When the soldiers of Estevão da Gama returned from Suez, they brought water 5  
 6 containers that they poured on the Jews' door in the *Direita* street to make fun of 6  
 7 them, saying to them: 'Here is the water that opened itself to your ancestors when 7  
 8 they were escaping from Egypt.'<sup>30</sup> 8

9 9  
 10 The classic reference work on the history of medicine in Portugal Maximiano 10  
 11 Lemos (1860–1923), published in 1899, added no new detail to those 11  
 12 supplied by Ficalho in Orta's biography.<sup>31</sup> Remarkably enough, Lemos's brief 12  
 13 general conclusion was devoted to singling out Orta's work (along with that 13  
 14 of Henrique Cuellar and Amato Lusitano) as a first-class example of sixteenth- 14  
 15 century Portugal's contribution to the progress of 'foreign scientific movement' 15  
 16 [*movimento científico estrangeiro*]; in addition to emphasizing that the debt 16  
 17 owed to the sixteenth- to eighteenth-century Portuguese 'Jewish physicians, all 17  
 18 of them pilgrims' [*médicos judeus, peregrinos todos*] should be recognized for the 18  
 19 greater glory of Portuguese medicine. Having only mentioned Amato Lusitano, 19  
 20 Rodrigo de Castro, Abraham Zacuto and António Nunes Ribeiro Sanches, he 20  
 21 regretted that 'religious intolerance' had been 'the chief [historical] obstacle' to 21  
 22 the 'development of medicine as well as of the all other sciences' in Portugal.<sup>32</sup> 22

23 It was not until 1934 that a turning point occurred in the historiography 23  
 24 of Garcia de Orta. The big step forward resulted from the patient research 24  
 25 undertaken by the social physician and historian of medicine Augusto da Silva 25  
 26 Carvalho (1861–1957)<sup>33</sup> on the trials opened by the Inquisition of Évora 26  
 27 against a number of descendants of Fernão de Orta, Garcia's father, and of 27  
 28 their relatives, always under the accusation of crypto-Judaism, for his research 28  
 29 illuminated numerous details concerning the Orta family during the sixteenth 29  
 30 30

31 <sup>30</sup> 'Quando os soldados de Estevão da Gama voltaram de Suez, trouxeram garrafas de 31  
 32 agua, que derramavam por troça á porta dos judeus da rua Direita dizendo lhes: "Vedes aquí a 32  
 33 agua, que se abriu a vossos antepassados, quando foram fugindo do Egypto"' (Ficalho, *Garcia* 33  
 34 *da Orta e o seu tempo*, p. 172). The textual quotation comes from chapter VII of a work with 34  
 35 14 chapters and almost 400 pages. 35

36 <sup>31</sup> Maximiano Lemos, *História da medicina em Portugal. Doutrinas e instituições* [1899] 36  
 37 (2 vols, Lisbon, 1991), vol. I, pp. 223–35. For a biographical sketch of Lemos, see Hernani 37  
 38 Bastos Monteiro, 'Biografia de Maximiano Lemos', in Lemos (ed.), *História da medicina em* 38  
 39 *Portugal*, vol. II, pp. 296–315. 39

40 <sup>32</sup> Lemos, *História da medicina em Portugal*, vol. II, pp. 296–7. 40

41 <sup>33</sup> For a short bio-bibliography of Augusto da Silva Carvalho, see Mário de Sampaio 41  
 42 Ribeiro, *Elogios do doutor Silva Carvalho e do Almirante Gago Coutinho* (Lisboa, 1962), 42  
 pp. 16–18.

1 and seventeenth centuries. Not least, Silva Carvalho revealed and studied the  
 2 crucial inquisitorial trial of Catarina de Orta.

3 J. Lucio d'Azevedo's history of Portuguese *christãos novos*<sup>34</sup> provided Silva  
 4 Carvalho with an overview of the history of the Jewish minority in early  
 5 modern Portugal and their close relationships with that in Spain. And various  
 6 other studies published early in the twentieth century on the origins of Orta  
 7 family name, its presence during the sixteenth century in Bombay and above  
 8 all Elvas (where this surname was quite common among people belonging to  
 9 different crafts and professions, including a paper seller, a bachelor of medicine  
 10 and surgeon) and Garcia de Orta's familiarity with the Spanish language were  
 11 helpful to Silva Carvalho's attempt to reconstruct the family connections and  
 12 to follow the fortunes of many of its members pursued by the Holy Office.<sup>35</sup>  
 13 Finally, Silva Carvalho claimed that Garcia de Orta was of a Jewish-Castilian  
 14 lineage and that his parents had moved to Portugal in 1492 as a result of the  
 15 Catholic Monarchs' decree of the Jews' forced conversion to Christianity.

16 Silva Carvalho's discoveries, questioning both the Catholic and the  
 17 nationalistic bases of mainstream Portuguese historiography, could hardly leave  
 18 anyone indifferent at the time he published his valuable work on Garcia de Orta,  
 19 just one year after the dictator António de Oliveira Salazar had proclaimed  
 20 the *Estado Novo* (1933–74). Thus, in the work he offered to the *Academia de*  
 21 *Ciências de Lisboa* in 1934, on the occasion of the fourth centenary of Orta's  
 22 departure to India, Silva Carvalho found it convenient to capture his academic  
 23 fellows' sympathy by delicately tackling this doubly controversial issue.<sup>36</sup>

24 He resorted to the contents of Orta's single and singular work, the *Colóquios*,  
 25 as the main basis of his argument in favour of his Portuguese identity, by virtue  
 26 not only of the language in which Orta chose to write it (Portuguese, neither  
 27 Latin nor Spanish as chosen by other Portuguese writers of the time), but also of  
 28 his self-identification as a Portuguese national in the distribution of the opposing  
 29 roles assigned to the two main characters in his fictitious dialogues – Orta's 'our  
 30 Portuguese' [*os nossos portugueses*] versus Ruano's 'your Portuguese' [*os vossos*  
 31 *portugueses*].<sup>37</sup> In fact, Silva Carvalho considered the *Colóquios* as 'the first book  
 32

---

33 <sup>34</sup> J. Lucio d'Azevedo, *Historia dos christãos novos portugueses* (Lisboa, 1922).

34 <sup>35</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 61–4.

35 <sup>36</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 64–6: 'A convicção que assim adquiri de que Orta provinha de familia  
 36 espanhola, gerou a suspeita de que esta tivesse fugido para Portugal e como era tão frequente  
 37 nessa época, que essa imigração fôsse de judeus, logo se formou no meu espírito esta pergunta  
 38 ¿seria Orta judeu? ... Mas nesta altura tive um momento de hesitação, ¿teria eu o direito de  
 39 publicar as verdades que tinha fechadas na mão e que estabeleciam con segurança que Orta  
 40 era de origem espanhola, arriscando-me a fazer perder a Portugal filho tão celebrado?'

41 <sup>37</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 65–6: 'A hesitação foi curta, porque logo me convenci  
 42 de que se eram verdades relativas a um grande vulto, não podia ocultá-las e que aquele perigo  
 42 verdadeiramente não existia, porque se o autor dos *Colloquios* era filho de pais espanhóis e

1 of medicine ever written by our physicians in our language' and compared the 1  
 2 decision of his author to write it in his mother tongue with that of the French 2  
 3 surgeon Ambroise Paré (1509/1510–90).<sup>38</sup> 3  
 4 He explained the reasons for Orta's departure to India in terms of a synergistic 4  
 5 effect between two kinds of 'forces,' namely an 'expulsive' one [*força expulsive*] – 5  
 6 the increasing inquisitorial pressure on 'new Christians' under the reign of João 6  
 7 III, from 1525 and above all from 1531 – and a series of 'attractive' [*atrativas*] 7  
 8 forces he summarized as 'the spirit of adventure, and the longing to see new lands, 8  
 9 so marked among the Jews, and still more the scientific curiosity to explore the 9  
 10 marvellous and mysterious Orient that fascinated nationals and foreigners'.<sup>39</sup> 10  
 11 Thus, in Silva Carvalho's historiography there was still room for the 11  
 12 Portuguese imperial epic. In embarking for India, Garcia de Orta became 12  
 13 another 'great man' representative of 'the heroic and adventurous shape of our 13  
 14 discoverers and conquerors,' his peculiar mission having been 'to conquer and 14  
 15 discover so valuable a treasure for the sake of science and of his own country'.<sup>40</sup> 15  
 16 However, he rejected Ficalho's thesis that Garcia de Orta was touched by the 16  
 17 'fever from India' [*febre da Índia*] as a result of a 'lazy' [*perguiçoso*] temper, the 17  
 18 lack of great career expectations and 'the fumes from India' [*os fumos da Índia*] 18  
 19 entering the Lisbon university classrooms where he was then teaching.<sup>41</sup> And he 19  
 20 was rather sarcastic about Ficalho's views, stating that one of Orta's true motives 20  
 21 for going to India was 'the feeling of horror at the smoke of the bonfires for 21  
 22 which firewood was being piled'.<sup>42</sup> 22  
 23 \_\_\_\_\_ 23  
 24 andara nos estudos em Espanha, nascera em terra de Portugal e aqui se veio fixar logo que 24  
 25 saúu das Universidades, aqui exerceu a clinica e ensinava e quando julgou necessário abandonar 25  
 26 o continente, não fêz com tantos milhares, indo tentar fortuna na França, Inglaterra, Itália, 26  
 27 Países Baixos, Marrocos ou Turquia, mas escolhera o mais valioso dominio português dessa 27  
 28 época, que nunca trocara por outras terras, onde era tão afamado e querido e donde lhe 28  
 29 mandavam convites tentadores'. 29  
 30 <sup>38</sup> Ibid., p. 66: '... sendo assim o primer livro de medicina que os nossos médicos 30  
 31 escreveram na nossa língua, procedendo como Ambrósio Pareo, que por escrever em francês 31  
 32 foi tão louvado'. 32  
 33 <sup>39</sup> Orta's move to Lisbon coincided with the beginning of the troubles for the Jews 33  
 34 in Portugal after the 1525 Cortes dictated a number of measures against Jewish health 34  
 35 practitioners (physicians, pharmacists) who were even blamed of having poisoned their old- 35  
 36 Christian patients (Ibid., pp. 76–7); Ibid., p. 79: '... o espirito de aventura, e o ânsia de ver 36  
 37 novas terras, tão acentuada nos israelitas e ainda mais a curiosidade científica de explorar o 37  
 38 oriente magnífico e misterioso, que fascinava nacionais e estrangeiros'. 38  
 39 <sup>40</sup> Ibid.: '... grande homem que ao lado dos que também representam a feição heróica e 39  
 40 aventureira dos nossos descobridores e conquistadores, ia conquistar e descobrir para a ciência 40  
 41 e para a sua pátria, tão valioso tesouro'. 41  
 42 <sup>41</sup> Ficalho, *Garcia da Orta e o seu tempo*, pp. 62–3. 42  
 43 <sup>42</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', p. 80: '... era o horror dos fumos das fogueiras para que se 43  
 44 estava acarretando lenha ...'. 44

1 In a similar way, Silva Carvalho rejected the reasons which Ficalho had used 1  
2 to explain why Orta did not turn back to Portugal with his master Martim 2  
3 Affonso da Sousa at the end of 1538, arguing that in addition to his seeking 3  
4 his fortune in India by practising medicine and developing his natural history 4  
5 studies, it would have been a very rash thing to return to his mother country 5  
6 after 1536, when the Inquisition had been effectively established in Portugal.<sup>43</sup> 6  
7 So, without exactly neglecting Orta's medico-botanical investigations in Goa 7  
8 and other cities and regions of the Indian west coast (from Bombay to Ceylon), 8  
9 Silva Carvalho chose to pay much more attention to his family, as well as to the 9  
10 daily life of the Jewish community at Goa whose details were gathered from the 10  
11 inquisitorial records relating to the interrogations of Orta's relatives under trial. 11  
12 Silva Carvalho also disagreed with Ficalho, considering erroneous his views 12  
13 that Orta had been a mere and disinterested observer of a politico-religious 13  
14 atmosphere that was increasingly threatening for the Jews of Goa from the 14  
15 1540s onwards. He chose, on the contrary, to show great empathy for the fear 15  
16 that Garcia de Orta might have felt for himself and his family in the face of such 16  
17 a climate from as early as 1543, when the medical bachelor Jerónimo Dias had 17  
18 been burned at the stake.<sup>44</sup> And indeed, as shown by Cannas da Cunha, Orta 18  
19 appears to have openly manifested his concern for the fate of the community 19  
20 of new Christians in Portuguese India on the occasion of the imprisonment of 20  
21 Leonor Caldeira and other *crístãos-novos* at Cochim. It was then that he and 21  
22 other outstanding figures of the *Converso* community at Goa, on witnessing the 22  
23 shaving of their neighbours' beards in Cochim, asked the governor to curtail the 23  
24 *devassa*'s procedures and simply expel them.<sup>45</sup> 24  
25 Furthermore, Silva Carvalho claimed that the enlightened court of 25  
26 Nizamaluco, the Turcoman Sultan of Deccan, where Garcia de Orta was 26  
27 accustomed to spend long periods, was for him a suitable place not only for 27  
28 cultivating his intellectual and scientific interests, but also for having a break 28  
29 'from his constricted daily life' and being able to freely practise, as a faithful 29  
30 Jew, 'fasts and ritual ceremonies impossible to carry out in Goa without serious 30  
31 risk'.<sup>46</sup> And he emphasized that these travels also allowed him to visit in passing 31  
32 the house he had in Bombay, where he enjoyed 'many happy days when escaping 32  
33 33  
34 34  
35 35

---

36 <sup>43</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', p. 83. On the Holy Office in Goa, see Cannas da Cunha, 36  
37 *A Inquisição no Estado da Índia*; António José Saraiva, 'Appendix four: The Portuguese 37  
38 Inquisition in Goa (India), 1561–1812', in *The Marrano Factory*, pp. 342–53. 38  
39 <sup>44</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 96, 106–7. 39  
40 <sup>45</sup> Cannas da Cunha, *A Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, p. 137. 40  
41 <sup>46</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', pp. 100–101: 'um parêntese que na vida quotidiana 41  
42 apertada e constringida abria, podendo nêle dar largas libremente à prática dos jejuns e de 42  
cerimónias rituais, que em Goa só era possível com grande risco.'

- 1 from his tormented life in Goa, by delighting in his library and in the culture of 1  
 2 botanical species that he bought in different regions and collected.<sup>47</sup> 2
- 3 Finally, Silva Carvalho was critical of any physical characterization of *a race* by 3  
 4 measuring its average members, rather than by the medians of the whole *ethnic* 4  
 5 *group* (in agreement with Galton's biometrics) as well as of the psychological 5  
 6 characterization of any group solely by the qualities and abilities of its eminent men. 6  
 7 Yet, by quoting the Swiss journalist Maurice Muret (1870–1954),<sup>48</sup> he maintained 7  
 8 that there was to some extent a specific pattern of 'moral and mental characteristics 8  
 9 of Jews' (*características morais e mentais dos judeus*), and claimed that Garcia de 9  
 10 Orta was highly representative of the 'best qualities and aptitudes of Israelites': 10  
 11
- 12 Clearly, in Garcia de Orta's life there are multiple proofs that, like his co- 12  
 13 religionists, he had 'the merchant's carpet bag', the spirit of adventure, 13  
 14 cosmopolitan tendencies, a marked solidarity with those of his religion, a great 14  
 15 capacity to assimilate, extraordinary ability and ingenuity to take advantage of 15  
 16 and to develop alien ideas, and a marked disdain for philosophically studying the 16  
 17 causes and origins of things. In spite of his very tolerant character, he had rooted 17  
 18 religious beliefs and the corresponding zeal for proselytism ...<sup>49</sup> 18  
 19
- 20 In an article devoted to reconstructing Garcia de Orta's genealogy, the French 20  
 21 Hispanist and expert on Sephardic studies I.–S. Révah (1917–73)<sup>50</sup> published 21  
 22 in 1960 the claim that Silva Carvalho had definitively integrated 'Garcia de Orta 22  
 23 into the history of Peninsular crypto-Judaism' and paid him tribute for this.<sup>51</sup> 23  
 24
- 25 <sup>47</sup> Ibid., pp. 101–4: '... muitas férias felices quando fugia à sua atormentada vida de 25  
 26 Goa, deleitando-se na sua livraria e na cultura das espécies botânicas que em variadas regiões 26  
 27 adquiria e colleccionava.' 27
- 28 <sup>48</sup> Maurice Muret, *L'Esprit Juif. Essai de Psychologie ethnique* (Paris, 1901), available 28  
 29 at <http://archive.org/stream/espritjuif00muregoog#page/n8/mode/2up> (10 November 29  
 30 2013). Muret's theses at this work have been qualified as "discretly" antisemitic. See also 30  
 31 <http://www.hls-dhs-dss.ch/textes/f/F46536.php>. 31
- 32 <sup>49</sup> Carvalho, 'Garcia d'Orta', p. 165: 'Evidentemente na vida de Orta há múltiplas provas 32  
 33 de que, com os seus correligionários, tinha a bossa de negociante, o espírito de aventura, 33  
 34 tendências cosmopolitas, acentuada solidariedade com os da sua religião, grande poder de 34  
 35 assimilação, extraordinária aptidão e engenho para aproveitar e desenvolver as ideias alheias, 35  
 36 e acentuado desprezo pelo estudo filosófico na parte em que se trata das causas e origens 36  
 37 das coisas. Apesar de muito tolerante, tinha arregaçadas crenças religiosas e o correspondente 37  
 38 fervor de proselitismo ... Pode pois dizer-se dum modo geral que ele representava bem as 38  
 39 melhores qualidades e aptidões dos israelitas.' 39
- 40 <sup>50</sup> See [http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsourc/judaica/ejud\\_0002\\_0017\\_0\\_166](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsourc/judaica/ejud_0002_0017_0_16679.html) 40  
 41 79.html (4 December 2013). 41
- 42 <sup>51</sup> 'Utilisant les données fournies par de nombreux procès inquisitoriaux qu'il avait 42  
 43 patiemment découverts, l'académicien portugais intégrait définitivement dans l'histoire du 43  
 44 crypto-judaïsme péninsulaire.' See Révah, 'La famille de Garcia de Orta', p. 407. 44

1 Relying, like Silva Carvalho, on inquisitorial records preserved at Lisbon, he 1  
 2 corrected some erroneous details given by the former, and reconstructed Orta's 2  
 3 family from the late fifteenth century to the mid-seventeenth century by tracking 3  
 4 its members' fortunes in the context of the Sephardic diaspora (as a part of either 4  
 5 clandestine Marrano groupings or official Jewish communities) all around the 5  
 6 world. Révah complained that Silva Carvalho's monograph study, despite its 6  
 7 relevance, was relatively unknown among historians of the Marranos.<sup>52</sup> More 7  
 8 astonishing, however, was the Portuguese establishment historians' reaction to 8  
 9 the idea that Orta might have been a crypto-Jew.<sup>53</sup> In 1963, on the occasion 9  
 10 of the fourth centenary of the publication of Orta's *Colóquios dos simples*, a 10  
 11 whole issue of the journal of the *Junta das Missões Geográficas e de Investigações* 11  
 12 *do Ultramar* (dependent on the Portuguese Colonial Ministry) was devoted 12  
 13 to the figure and work of whom this official journal had even taken its title 13  
 14 from.<sup>54</sup> In the issue's preface, the *Junta's* executive president introduced Garcia 14  
 15 de Orta as one of the 'great pioneers of human knowledge' [*grandes pioneiros do* 15  
 16 *conhecimento humano*], emphasizing his inspiring role for all those devoted to 16  
 17 'research of tropical things and peoples' [*investigação das coisas e gentes tropicais*]. 17  
 18 He stressed the 'exceptionally rich personality of the *Colóquios's* author as a man 18  
 19 and a Portuguese, as a thinker and scientist', but made no mention at all of Orta's 19  
 20 *cristão-novo* lineage, and still less to the posthumous burning of his remains at 20  
 21 the instance of the Holy Office.<sup>55</sup> After admitting that the knowledge included 21  
 22 in the *Colóquios* had been unable to resist the 'universal and inexorable law of 22  
 23 obsolescence', he praised the lasting quality of Orta's 'rigorous objectivity', 'cleverly 23  
 24 critical methodology' and 'open spirit, with a sense of scientific sympathy, albeit 24  
 25 without servitude nor inversion of values, toward the contribution of all human 25  
 26 cultures to the common [human] heritage'. 26

27 Révah's work was simply ignored, and Silva Carvalho's thesis was openly 27  
 28 resisted by the most important contributors to the issue. Without denying 28  
 29 Orta's belonging to a lineage of *Christãos novos*, they claimed that he was a 29  
 30 true Catholic in his religious beliefs and practices, and that his postmortem 30  
 31

32 <sup>52</sup> There appear to have been some exceptions to this rule, like the works by Augusto 32  
 33 d'Esaguy, 'Garcia de Orta and the Inquisition', *Bulletin of the Institute of the History of Medicine*, 33  
 34 5 (1937): 483–7; and Harry Friedenwald, 'Medical pioneers in the East Indies', *Bulletin of* 34  
 35 *the History of Medicine*, 9 (1941): 436–45 (pp. 440–41, particularly). From the contents 35  
 36 of the entry 'Orta, Garcia de' at the *Encyclopaedia Judaica* (26 vols, Jerusalem–New York, 36  
 37 1971–72), vol. XII, col. 1486, it appears that his presumed crypto-Judaism had been already 37  
 38 canonised among Jewish Studies scholars by the early 1970s. 38

39 <sup>53</sup> Again, there are exceptions like the entry 'Orta (Garcia de)' at the *Grande Enciclopédia* 39  
 40 *Portuguesa e Brasileira* (40 vols, Lisbon–Rio de Janeiro, 1936–60), vol. XIX, pp. 674–6. 40

41 <sup>54</sup> Garcia de Orta: *Revista da Junta das Missões Geográficas e de Investigações do Ultramar*, 41  
 42 11/4 (1963). 42

42 <sup>55</sup> Carlos K. Abecasis, 'Pórtico', *Garcia de Orta*, 11/4 (1963): 615–18. 42

1 trial by the Holy Office was just an unfortunate error caused by Catarina de 1  
 2 Orta's testimony when facing that terrible court which accused her dead brother 2  
 3 of having practiced the Jewish religion and proselytized for that faith among 3  
 4 *cristãos novos*. 4

5 Let us consider their views in more detail. 5

6 While Jayme Walter approved as correct Silva Carvalho's logic, except for 6  
 7 his conclusion,<sup>56</sup> other contributors like António da Silva Rego, Professor at the 7  
 8 Instituto Superior de Ciências Sociais e Política Ultramarina, or Luís de Pina 8  
 9 (1901–72), Professor of History of Medicine and Medical Deontology at Porto 9  
 10 University,<sup>57</sup> defended the idea that Orta had been always a true Catholic by 10  
 11 aligning themselves with the Jesuit Abílio Martins' thesis in a recently published 11  
 12 article under the unequivocal title 'Garcia de Orta's Catholicism'.<sup>58</sup> And, 12  
 13 amazingly enough, Pina enthusiastically qualified Martins' work as 'valuable' 13  
 14 and 'absolutely unsuspecting' (*insuspeitíssimo*), and quoted at length from its 14  
 15 most expressive passages in support of Orta's true Catholicism.<sup>59</sup> 15

16 While acknowledging that Silva Carvalho's study was 'objectively interesting 16  
 17 because of the new biographical data' it provided, Martins claimed that this 17  
 18 biographical work had a 'basic defect', namely, a 'scientifically disqualifying 18  
 19 anachronistic sectarianism', consisting of having forced Garcia de Orta's identity 19  
 20 to the point of presenting him as 'an authentic 'Marrano' in its traditional 20  
 21 meaning of a 'crypto-Judaizer' by showing him as being 'incessantly fearful of 21  
 22 the Inquisition, restricting to a minimum his religious practices, and unable 22  
 23 to behave with the easy and carefree naturalness of any sincere and convinced 23  
 24 Christian of his time'.<sup>60</sup> 24

25 To Martins, this way of thinking reproduced an 'easy and simplistic tendency 25  
 26 in the primary spirit of many people to transform any historical figure officially 26  
 27 27

28 <sup>56</sup> 'Seguindo o raciocínio de Silva Carvalho, que em nossa opinião é correcto até cegar 28  
 29 à conclusão ...' Jayme Walter, 'Garcia de Orta. Relance da sua vida', *Garcia de Orta*, 11/4 29  
 30 (1963): 619–22 (p. 619). 30

31 <sup>57</sup> A. da Silva Rego, 'Garcia de Orta e a ideia de tolerância religiosa', *Garcia de Orta*, 31  
 32 11/4 (1963): 663–76; Luís de Pina, 'O método científico no luso-tropicalismo de Garcia 32  
 33 de Orta', *Garcia de Orta*, 11/4 (1963): 631–62. On Luís da Pina and his work, see [http://](http://pt.wikipedia.org/wiki/Lu%C3%ADs_de_Pina) 33  
 34 [pt.wikipedia.org/wiki/Lu%C3%ADs\\_de\\_Pina](http://pt.wikipedia.org/wiki/Lu%C3%ADs_de_Pina) (4 December 2013). 34

35 <sup>58</sup> Abílio Martins, 'O catolicismo de Garcia de Orta', *Brotéria*, 77 (1963): 35–45. 35

36 <sup>59</sup> Pina, 'O método científico no luso-tropicalismo de Garcia de Orta', pp. 638–40. 36

37 <sup>60</sup> 'Estudo objectivamente interessante, pelos novos dados biográficos que aduz, tem 37  
 38 contudo um defeitofundamental: um anacrónico sectarismo, cientificamente desqualificante, 38  
 39 que o leva a querer fazer, à viva força, de Garcia de Orta, um autêntico "marrano", no sentido 39  
 40 tradicional de "cripto-judaizante", incesantemente com medo da Inquisição, limitando 40  
 41 ao mínimo as suas práticas religiosas oficiais, e incapaz de reagir com a naturalidade fácil 41  
 42 e despreocupada dum cristão convicto e sincero do seu tempo' (Martins, 'O catolicismo de 42  
 Garcia de Orta', p. 35).

1 Christian albeit having Jewish blood into a hypocrite and a coward' whose 1  
 2 Catholicism was just 'simulation', and whose true beliefs were disguised because 2  
 3 of terror of the Inquisition.<sup>61</sup> Furthermore, he pointed out that 'whatever 3  
 4 personal sympathy or antipathy we have for the "people of the Nation", this does 4  
 5 not give us any right to unjustly defame real personalities whose loyalty and 5  
 6 trustworthiness of character are more than enough known.'<sup>62</sup> 6

7 Martins claimed that Orta's image had been subjected to 'moody, tendentious 7  
 8 insinuations' and 'distorting and even genuinely slanderous interpretations 8  
 9 leading to a false and undignified image from a moral point of view of his 9  
 10 character, personality, and intimate convictions', and aimed to restore his 10  
 11 good Catholic name in both religious and moral terms by reinterpreting the 11  
 12 meaning Silva Carvalho had given to his biography without providing any 12  
 13 additional information. 13

14 In order to defend his claims Martins paid particular attention to the three 14  
 15 following issues. First, he devaluated the inquisitorial testimony of Catarina de 15  
 16 Orta on the basis of the methods of that 'terrible court' and of the presumably 16  
 17 'ancestral paganism' of a family (in particular, its feminine elements) of 'rootless 17  
 18 people whose own language (a rather closed Spanish) did not facilitate their 18  
 19 children's full integration into the Christian and Portuguese environment where 19  
 20 they lived', and whose old traditional practices could have included some more or 20  
 21 less implicitly Judaizing ingredients.<sup>63</sup> Secondly, he claimed that some passages 21  
 22 in Orta's *Colóquios* were 'spontaneous reactions' to 'the lively and heartfelt reality 22  
 23 of his Catholicism', while other passages had been misinterpreted as crypto- 23  
 24 Jewish hostility against the friars.<sup>64</sup> Last but not least, he emphasized Orta's good 24  
 25 relationships with the Jesuits in the context of their hospital care activities and 25  
 26 their educational works in their College of San Paulo at Goa as late as in 1559.<sup>65</sup> 26

27 The single exception in the monographic issue commemorating the fourth 27  
 28 anniversary of Orta's *Colóquios*, to the general rule of devaluating, if not 28  
 29 disqualifying, Silva Carvalho's claims about Garcia de Orta's crypto-Jewish 29  
 30 identity, was provided by Alberto Iria, the Director of the *Arquivo Histórico* 30

31

32

33

34 <sup>61</sup> 'Existe, no espirito primário de muitagente, uma tentência fácil e simplista para 34  
 35 fazer, de qualquer figura histórica oficialmente cristã mas com sangue hebreu, um hipócrita 35  
 36 e um covarde, como se o seu catolicismo não fosse mais que fingimento, e o disfarce das suas 36  
 37 verdadeiras crenças se explicasse apenas pelo terror da Inquisição' (Ibid., p. 35). 37

38 <sup>62</sup> 'Todavia, qualquer que seja a nossa simpatia ou antipatia pessoal pela "gente da 38  
 39 Nação", não nos dá isto, sem mais, direito a caluniarmos injustamente personalidades reais, 39  
 40 cuja lealdade e integridade decarácter são por de mais conhecidas' (Ibid., p. 35). 40

41 <sup>63</sup> Martins, 'O catolicismo de Garcia de Orta', pp. 36–8. 41

42 <sup>64</sup> Ibid., pp. 38–42. 42

<sup>65</sup> Ibid., pp. 42–6. 42

- 1 *Ultramarino*.<sup>66</sup> After praising Silva Carvalho's 'laborious and patient research in 1  
 2 the Arquivo Nacional da Torre do Tombo which he daily visited', he then stated 2  
 3 that Carvalho had revealed this 'great truth, the most resounding truth' to the 3  
 4 'historical science of our days.' Iria went on to stress that the 'new biography 4  
 5 of Garcia de Orta had been welcomed abroad while its author was still alive', 5  
 6 by reporting not only Révah's praise, but also the indirect testimony that Silva 6  
 7 Carvalho had received letters of praise from such outstanding historians as 7  
 8 Arturo Castiglione, Édouard Jeanselme, Pietro Capparoni, Cecil Roth and Paul 8  
 9 Diepgen, among others.<sup>67</sup> 9
- 10 In contrast, Iria's references to any positive valuations of Silva Carvalho's work 10  
 11 by Portuguese scholars were restricted to just two. One, rather vague, was given by 11  
 12 the hygienist physician Fernando da Silva Correia (1893–1966), who appears to 12  
 13 have praised Carvalho's condition of 'restless worker in many fields' and frequent 13  
 14 user of the *Biblioteca Nacional* and of the *Arquivo Nacional* until a few months 14  
 15 before his death. Another, a little more explicit, was made by Possidónio Mateus 15  
 16 Laranjo Coelho (1877–1969), who was a curator of the *Arquivo Nacional* at 16  
 17 the time when Carvalho was doing research on its inquisitorial sources. Laranjo 17  
 18 Coelho, who had been the very recipient of Silva Carvalho's above-mentioned 18  
 19 indirect testimony, was particularly indebted to the latter for his contribution 19  
 20 to the local history of Castelo de Vide in having definitely proved that the town 20  
 21 had the 'honour' of being the place of birth of the 'great naturalist' (*a honra da 21*  
 22 *naturalidade do grande naturalista*). Furthermore, on the occasion of a solemn 22  
 23 commemoration of the fourth centenary of Garcia de Orta's *Colóquios* at the 23  
 24 *Academia Portuguesa da História* in June 1963, Laranjo Coelho, who was then 24  
 25 the president of this scientific institution, gave a lecture in the presence of the 25  
 26 Head of State about the Jewish quarter of Castelo de Vide, about physicians 26  
 27 and pharmacists contemporary to Orta, and about the biographic vicissitudes 27  
 28 of some of them in the Sephardic diaspora. Then, he is said to have evoked the 28  
 29 name of Silva Carvalho as a 'laborious and fruitful historian of Portuguese 29  
 30 medicine' whose 'valuable contribution' to Orta's biography he wisely praised 30  
 31 for having clarified 'passages still dark and unknown in the life and family of this 31  
 32 great naturalist'.<sup>68</sup> 32
- 33 Iria concluded his article by inviting new scholars to develop any aspect of 33  
 34 Silva Carvalho's discoveries on Garcia de Orta's life by emphasizing that his 34  
 35 'sensational revelations' were, according Révah, 'susceptible of *prolongements* 35  
 36 *fructueux*'. Moreover, he secured them archivists' 'best collaboration' by claiming 36  
 37 that the latter's mission was 'today more than ever, to help whoever are devoted 37  
 38 38
- 39 <sup>66</sup> Alberto Iria, 'Dos biógrafos portugueses de Garcia de Orta (Nótulas 39  
 40 biobibliográficas)', *Garcia de Orta*, 11/4 (1963): 833–56. 40
- 41 <sup>67</sup> Iria, 'Dos biógrafos portugueses de Garcia de Orta', pp. 848–56. 41
- 42 <sup>68</sup> Iria, 'Dos biógrafos portugueses de Garcia de Orta', pp. 853–5. 42

1 to historical research' and, more in general, to boost the 'historical sense' among 1  
 2 the public, in explicit accordance with Robert-Henri Bautier (1922–2010), 2  
 3 Professor of Archival Science at the prestigious French École de Chartes whose 3  
 4 authorized words he chose to quote at this point.<sup>69</sup> 4

5 Definitely, Iria's historical agenda was closer to Silva Carvalho's and Révah's 5  
 6 than to Pina's and Silva Rego's. And historical research on Orta's family 6  
 7 undertaken by Révah, Novinsky and other scholars thereafter did not leave 7  
 8 room at all for Martins' picture, showing, as we have already seen, that many of 8  
 9 their members were prosecuted as crypto-Jews during several generations by the 9  
 10 Portuguese Inquisition. Indeed, as Novinsky has recently remarked, the Holy 10  
 11 Office forced the Portuguese *cristãos novos* to build an underground society 11  
 12 and to maintain a double life so that discretion became an integral part of their 12  
 13 everyday lives and crypto-Judaism was their only way of living the Jewish faith.<sup>70</sup> 13  
 14 Yet, Novinsky has also warned about the risks implied by Révah's 'dangerous 14  
 15 generalisations on Marranism' led by his 'persistence in believing in the absolute 15  
 16 truth of the trials' and, in agreement with Josef Kaplan's views about Sephardic 16  
 17 Jews' complex, protean and fluid identity (neither necessarily nor exclusively 17  
 18 religious, but including other mixed socio-cultural features, too), she stressed the 18  
 19 'enormous solidarity between the expatriates and their relatives who remained 19  
 20 in Portugal' beyond any religious belief.<sup>71</sup> 20

21

22

23

24

25

26 <sup>69</sup> Ibid., p. 856. 26

27 <sup>70</sup> Novinsky, 'A família marrana de Garcia de Orta, o "correio" dos judeus', pp. 361–9 27  
 28 (p. 359). 28

29 <sup>71</sup> Novinsky, 'A família marrana de Garcia de Orta, o "correio" dos judeus', pp. 360–61. 29  
 30 For an alternative view to Révah on the relationship between the Portuguese Inquisition 30  
 31 and the New Christians, see Saraiva, *The Marrano Factory*, first published in Portuguese in 31  
 32 1969. The documents related to the acrid controversy this book provoked between Révah 32  
 33 and Saraiva at the *Diário de Lisboa* from 6 May to 2 September 1971 have been transcribed 33  
 34 at its appendices 1–3 (pp. 235–341). On the processes of identity configuration and 34  
 35 exchange between the 'new Christians' and the 'new Jews' among early modern Sephardim, 35  
 36 and the crucial role that cultural diversity and mixing usually played in these processes, see, 36  
 37 for example, Yerushalmi, *De la corte española al gueto italiano ...*, pp. 21–42; Yosef Kaplan, 37  
 38 'Political concepts in the world of the Portuguese Jews of Amsterdam during the seventeenth 38  
 39 century: the problem of exclusion and the boundaries of self-identity', in Yosef Kaplan, Henry 39  
 40 Méchoulan and Richard H. Popkin (eds), *Menasseh Ben Israel and his World* (Leiden, 1989), 40  
 41 pp. 45–62; and Yosef Kaplan, 'The Portuguese community in 17th century Amsterdam and 41  
 42 the Ashkenazi world', in Jozeph Michman (ed.), *Dutch Jewish History Vol. II. 4th Symposium*  
 42 *on the History of the Jews in the Netherlands Entitled 'Interactions and Interrelations': Selected*  
*Papers* (Jerusalem, 1989), pp. 23–45. 42

1	<b>Final Remarks</b>	1
2		2
3	By way of conclusion, I would like to make a couple of historiographical	3
4	remarks referring to issues to which it is always useful to be alert despite their	4
5	apparent obviousness.	5
6	On the one hand, a Jewish constituent part should be more systematically	6
7	integrated into early modern history of Portuguese medicine and science, while	7
8	any essentialist conception of identity should be avoided, and the mutual fluid	8
9	exchange of identities between <i>new Christians</i> and <i>new Jews</i> detectable among	9
10	the early modern Sephardim should be more generally assumed. The lives and	10
11	careers of a great many (if not most) of the remarkable physicians and natural	11
12	philosophers in the splendid early modern times of the Portuguese empire were,	12
13	like merchants and other business men, highly conditioned by the fact that	13
14	they were of Jewish lineage, whether they were <i>cristãos novos</i> , Marranos or <i>new</i>	14
15	<i>Jews</i> , since they had to cope with the permanent threat of the Portuguese Holy	15
16	Office, and more generally, with the many difficulties that derived from Catholic	16
17	intolerance to their religious and cultural identity.	17
18	Furthermore the early modern history of the Iberian kingdoms, as well as	18
19	of Portuguese and Spanish medicine and science, need to be approached in a	19
20	manner freer of servitude to nationalistic and/or imperialistic historical agendas,	20
21	in a more systematic way, and by paying more attention to their transoceanic	21
22	expansion, in order to better understand the rise and fall of the two earliest	22
23	European worldwide empires as well as the vicissitudes of Iberian physicians and	23
24	scientists in the context of a global history.	24
25		25
26		26
27		27
28		28
29		29
30		30
31		31
32		32
33		33
34		34
35		35
36		36
37		37
38		38
39		39
40		40
41		41
42		42